Recapture Canyon: An Exercise in Consensus Building

Jeffery D. Nokes
Brigham Young University
Jeff_nokes@byu.edu
June 7, 2019
A Place for All 2019
Recapture Canyon Area
Travel Restrictions

Under the Code of Federal Regulations 16 CFR 173.2, BLM has the authority to
close an area to monitored recreational use, including Off Highway Vehicles (OHV)
use, when it concludes that the area is causing, or is threatening to cause,
considerable adverse effects to resources, including cultural resources.

Based on the damage to the cultural resources in the Recapture Canyon area
resulting from OHV use, which BLM personnel have observed and documented, and the likelihood
of continuing damage from OHV use, it is appropriate to use this authority to
close portions of the Recapture Canyon area to OHV use. Therefore, it is my decision to close
portions of the Recapture Canyon area, as depicted on the adjacent map, to monitored
recreational use, including OHV use. This closure is effective September 1, 2007.

This closure order is not intended to be a permanent order and it does not change the
designation in the 1999 San Juan Resource Management Plan (RMP) that the lands
excluding the Recapture Canyon area are “open” to cross-country monitored use.
However, pursuant to 16 CFR 173.2, the area shall be closed to OHV use until
the considerable adverse effects leading to the closure have been eliminated and
measures have been implemented to prevent reoccurrence.

The areas depicted in the closed sections of the adjacent map are now officially “closed” to
monitored recreational use, except for permitted and/or administrative uses. The areas
and routes outside of the closure area remain “open” to all types of recreational use,
including monitored, in accordance with the RMP.

For more information, please contact:

Bureau of Land Management
Monument Field Office
101 North Main Street
P.O. Box 7
Monument, UT 84535
(435) 587-1294

treadlightly.org

LEAVING A GOOD IMPRESSION

Travel and recreate with minimum impact.
Respect the environment and the rights of others.
Educate yourself, and plan and prepare before you go.
Adhere to future use of the outdoors; leave it better than you found it.
Discover the rewards of responsible recreation.
Secretary Zinke Announces Expanded Recreation Access and BLM's New Trail System in Recapture Canyon

Decision provides nearly 7 miles of recreational opportunities while protecting cultural and natural resources

04/10/2017 - 13:15
Should the organizers of the Recapture Canyon demonstration have been prosecuted?
Recapture Canyon Demonstration: Should the Demonstration Organizers Have Been Prosecuted?

You will be given some background information and a number of documents related to a demonstration organized in Recapture Canyon in southern Utah to protest the extended closure of some primitive roads. As you listen to the arguments made in the documents, record the evidence and reasons for prosecution on the left of the scales and reasons against prosecution on the right. After analyzing the evidence, on the back of this paper write and defend your interpretation using evidence from the documents. Consider the source and perspective of each piece of evidence as you develop your interpretation.

Evidence and Reasons For Prosecution

Evidence and Reasons Against Prosecution
The Salt Lake Tribune is a daily newspaper published in the city of Salt Lake City, Utah, with the largest weekday circulation but second-largest Sunday circulation, behind the Deseret News. The Tribune, often referred to as just "the Trib," is owned by Paul Huntsman and printed through a joint operating agreement with the Deseret News through the Newspaper Agency Corporation. On April 20, 2016, Huntsman Family Investments, a private equity firm headed by Paul Huntsman, announced that they would be buying the Tribune. The newspaper's motto, at the top of its masthead, is "Utah's Independent Voice Since 1871."
Recapture Canyon Demonstration: Should the Demonstration Organizers Have Been Prosecuted?

You will be given some background information and a number of documents related to a demonstration organized in Recapture Canyon in southern Utah to protest the extended closure of some primitive roads. As you listen to the arguments made in the documents, record the evidence and reasons for prosecution on the left of the scales and reasons against prosecution on the right. After analyzing the evidence, on the back of this paper write and defend your interpretation using evidence from the documents. Consider the source and perspective of each piece of evidence as you develop your interpretation.

Evidence and Reasons For Prosecution

The demonstrators appear to be in a closed area.
The total disregard for law (no helmets on children)

Evidence and Reasons Against Prosecution

They are exercising their rights (flag)
The road appears fairly established
Recapture Canyon: Arrival of ATV protest about 1 mile into closed area

• Video of Protest
Source: Photograph posted on the website of the Southern Utah Wilderness Alliance, a group dedicated to preserving wilderness, showing demonstrators during the Recapture Canyon protest in October 2014. Found at https://suwa.org/county-commissioner-defies-blm-thumbs-nose-native-american-heritage
As I returned home to Blanding, Utah for my father’s funeral, I passed over the Recapture Dam and looked to the south. Almost 30 years ago, my father and I spent a few summers moving cattle up and down that canyon. While you would occasionally see a piece of Anasazi pottery, that was always a sideshow. We needed the canyon to graze our cattle as we moved them to the summer pasture on the Blue Mountain. I wonder if in today’s environment, we would be accused of breaking the law.

Source: Comment made by Don Guymon, chairman of Grassroots Utah, who grew up in San Juan County, posted August 3, 2015, on the politically conservative website, Utah Politico Hub, in response to the photograph included as Document 3 in this text set. Found at https://www.utahpoliticohub.com/author/don-guymon/
Source: Part of a radio program called KSL In-Depth, broadcast by KSL radio from Salt Lake City, Utah, recorded April 10, 2017. Voices include Dave Cawley and Jeff Caplan. Found at [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=G6coDoWgOVo](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=G6coDoWgOVo)
Recapture Canyon Demonstration: Should the Demonstration Organizers Have Been Prosecuted?

You will be given some background information and a number of documents related to a demonstration organized in Recapture Canyon in southern Utah to protest the extended closure of some primitive roads. As you listen to the arguments made in the documents, record the evidence and reasons for prosecution on the left of the scales and reasons against prosecution on the right. After analyzing the evidence, on the back of this paper write and defend your interpretation using evidence from the documents. Consider the source and perspective of each piece of evidence as you develop your interpretation.

Evidence and Reasons For Prosecution

The demonstrators appear to be in a closed area.
The total disregard for law (no helmets on children)

Evidence and Reasons Against Prosecution

They are exercising their rights (flag)
The road appears fairly established
3. Classroom Consensus Document
Identify the Issue

• What is the nature of the problem?
• What are different perspectives about the solutions that should be considered?
• What are some of the limitations and strengths of each perspective?
• What are some of the areas of sharpest conflict?
• What are outside issues that influence the problem and solutions?
Write a statement of personal beliefs about the issue...

• What is the most pressing concerns regarding
  • Recapture canyon
  • Federal v. local control of land

• What are three policies you would strongly support regarding ATV travel and the protection of artifacts in Recapture Canyon?
Group Statement about the Issue

• What are three policies you would strongly support regarding ATV travel and the protection of artifacts in Recapture Canyon?

• With a partner identify 2 policies you could support regarding ATV travel and the protection of artifacts in Recapture Canyon?

• In teams of 4 refine your 2 policies
Class Statement about the Issue

• In teams of 4 refine your 2 policies

• As a class create a policy we could all support regarding ATV travel and the protection of artifacts in Recapture Canyon?